

# John Stuart Mill Cup Score Sheet

Judge Name: \_\_\_\_\_

<p><b>TEAM A</b> _____</p> <p><b>Case 1</b></p> <p><b>Team A Presentation</b></p> <p>A. Was Team A's presentation clear and well structured? (1-5) ____</p> <p>B. Did Team A's presentation identify and thoroughly discuss the central moral dimensions of the case? (1-5) ____</p> <p>C. Did Team A's presentation indicate both awareness and thoughtful consideration of different viewpoints, including those that would loom large in the reasoning of individuals who disagree with the team's position? (1-5) ____</p>	<p><b>TEAM B</b> _____</p> <p><b>Case 1</b></p> <p><b>Team B Commentary</b></p> <p>A. Was Team B's response tailored to Team A's particular arguments and conclusions? (1-5) ____</p> <p>B. Did Team A ask Team B at least one good question? (1-5) ____</p> <p>C. Did Team B offer comments that would be of service to Team A in Team A's effort to arrive at a more defensible position? (1-5) ____</p>
<p><b>1. Team A's Presentation Score</b> (Total A-C above) <span style="float: right;">of 15</span></p>	<p><b>2. Team B's commentary score (Total A-C above)</b> <span style="float: right;">of 15</span></p> <p style="text-align: center;">-----end of case 1-----</p>
<p><b>Team A Response to Commentary</b></p> <p>A. Did Team A actually address Team B's comments? (1-5) ____</p> <p>B. Did Team A's response demonstrate open-mindedness and a lack of dogmatism? (1-5) ____</p> <p>C. Did Team A's response demonstrate respect for Team B's perspective? (1-5) ____</p>	<p><b>Case 2</b></p> <p><b>Team B Presentation</b></p> <p>A. Was Team B's presentation clear and systematic? (1-5) ____</p> <p>B. Did Team B's presentation identify and thoroughly discuss the central moral dimensions of the case? (1-5) ____</p> <p>C. Did Team B's presentation indicate both awareness and thoughtful consideration of different viewpoints, including those that would loom large in the reasoning of individuals who disagree with the team's position? (1-5) ____</p>
<p><b>3. Team A's Response to Commentary Score (Total A-C above)</b> <span style="float: right;">of 15</span></p>	<p><b>5. Team B's Presentation Score (Total A-C above)</b> <span style="float: right;">of 15</span></p>
<p><b>Team A Response to Judges' Questions</b></p> <p>A. Did Team A actually address the judges' questions? (1-5) ____</p> <p>B. Did Team A's responses demonstrate open-mindedness and a lack of dogmatism? (1-5) ____</p> <p>C. Did Team A's response demonstrate respect for the judges' perspective? (1-5) ____</p>	<p><b>Team B Response to Commentary</b></p> <p>A. Did Team B actually address Team A's comments? (1-5) ____</p> <p>B. Did Team B's response demonstrate open-mindedness and a lack of dogmatism? (1-5) ____</p> <p>C. Did Team B's response demonstrate respect for Team A's perspective? (1-5) ____</p>
<p><b>4. Team A's Response to Judges' Questions Score (Total A-C above)</b> <span style="float: right;">of 15</span></p> <p style="text-align: center;">-----end of case 1-----</p>	<p><b>7. Team B's Response to Commentary Score (Total A-C above)</b> <span style="float: right;">of 15</span></p>
<p><b>Case 2</b></p> <p><b>Team A Commentary</b></p> <p>A. Was Team A's response tailored to Team B's particular arguments and conclusions? (1-5) ____</p> <p>B. Did Team A ask Team B at least one good question? (1-5) ____</p> <p>C. Did Team A offer comments that would be of service to Team B in Team B's effort to arrive at a more defensible position? (1-5) ____</p>	<p><b>Team B Response to Judges' Questions</b></p> <p>A. Did Team B actually address the judges' questions? (1-5) ____</p> <p>B. Did Team B's responses demonstrate open-mindedness and a lack of dogmatism? (1-5) ____</p> <p>C. Did Team B's response demonstrate respect for the judges' perspective? (1-5) ____</p>
<p><b>6. Team A's commentary score (Total A-C above)</b> <span style="float: right;">of 15</span></p>	<p><b>8. Team B's Response to Judges' Questions Score (Total A-C above)</b> <span style="float: right;">of 15</span></p>
<p><b>9. Total</b> <span style="float: right;">of 60</span></p>	<p><b>9. Total</b> <span style="float: right;">of 60</span></p>

Comments for Team A

Comments for Team B